

APPLICATION NUMBER		22/01113/FUL	
SITE ADDRESS:		Stables, The Old Mill House, Bradbourne	
DESCRIPTION OF DEVELOPMENT		Conversion of stables to form 1no. holiday let and erection of attached agricultural building	
CASE OFFICER	Mr. G. A. Griffiths	APPLICANTS	Sandra and David Potter
PARISH	Bradbourne	AGENT	Lathams
WARD MEMBERS	Cllr. J. Rose	DETERMINATION TARGET	25 th November 2022
REASON FOR DETERMINATION BY COMMITTEE	Considered sensitive by the Development Manager	REASON FOR SITE VISIT (IF APPLICABLE)	To assess the proposed development in its context.

MATERIAL PLANNING ISSUES
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policy principle • Whether the building is worthy of conversion and the impact of the proposed conversion on the character and appearance of the building and the setting of the historic complex of Listed buildings • Amenity • Highway matters • Ecology • Climate change

RECOMMENDATION
Refusal

1. THE SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

- 1.1 Bradbourne Mill comprises of an enclave of three separately listed buildings (grade II, listed 1983) – the Mill House, Mill Buildings and the Water Mill, together with a curtilage listed building at the southern end of the complex. All the listed buildings date from the late 18th/early 19th century. The Bletch Brook runs through the site. All of the service buildings were converted to residential use (the mill house having an established residential use) in the early 2000s.
- 1.2 The application relates to the 'stable' block which is located to the northern side of the Mill House. This single-storey, rectangular, timber clad (horizontal waney-edged oak) and a solid/blank clay tiled roofed outbuilding was approved in 2007. On the eastern side of the stable block is a lean-to car port but this element did not feature as a part of the approved stable block.





2. DETAILS OF THE APPLICATION

- 2.1 Planning permission (ref: 05/00726/FUL) was granted for a stables building in 2007 and they were erected shortly thereafter. As this is a newer build, it is not deemed a curtilage listed building but is nevertheless in the setting of listed buildings at Bradbourne Mill.
- 2.2 The proposed development is the conversion of the stable block (with internal mezzanine and garden room extension on the eastern side) to form 1no. holiday let and the erection of an attached agricultural building (storage building) off the northern elevation of the stable building.
- 2.3 The existing stable block has three blank sides (north, east and south). Its principal elevation faces west and contains a pair of solid timber boarded doors on the right hand side and two stable doors, and associated small windows, to the recessed front section. On the west elevation it is proposed to retain the two large timber doors but infill the large opening with fully glazed windows. It is proposed to block one of the stable doors and use the other as the entrance door to the holiday-let. The south elevation is to remain blank. The rear roof slope of the stable block is proposed to have two conservation rooflights and a flue pipe. An air source heat pump is also proposed adjacent to the east wall of the stable building.
- 2.4 On the east elevation it was proposed to remove a large section of the rear wall and erect a 'garden room' extension which would essentially replace an existing open ended lean-to structure. This was initially proposed to have a flat (sedum) roof abutting above the existing eaves line. Its side walls were to be solid and timber clad (to match the rest of the building) and the east wall of the extension was proposed to be fully glazed set behind a series of five vertical timber fins or supports. However, further to discussion, this has been amended to make the extension appear more architecturally contiguous with the existing building. To this end, a catslide roof has been introduced, extending from the roof of the stable building.

- 2.5 The side elevations are proposed to have bi-fold doors and the rear (east) elevation to now be solid. This is to contain the extension within the area between the building and the historic field hedge. The conversion would provide for a living room/kitchen, w.c and utility, with a garden room in the proposed rear extension. The first floor is proposed to contain a bedroom, bathroom and a void overlooking the living area.
- 2.6 It is proposed to erect an attached, storage building onto the northern gable end of the stable block. This is to be a linear, rectangular, building with eaves and ridge matching the stable block (the footprint itself being slightly set back). It is proposed to be timber clad (to match the stable block building). On its western (principal) elevation, it is to have two pairs of double doors (solid boarded doors), a solid boarded pedestrian door and a small window. The north gable end is to be blank. The rear (east) elevation is to have a pair of solid boarded double doors. The roof proposed is to be laid with matching clay tiles.
- 2.7 The building is proposed to accommodate a compact tractor, lawn tractors and a trailer, along with a repair and maintenance area, with a work bench, a store which can be utilised for sheep/chickens, a wc and further storage space. The equipment is needed for the maintenance of the land around Bradbourne Mill and the agricultural land in the applicants' ownership.

3. PLANNING POLICY AND LEGISLATIVE FRAMEWORK

- 3.1 Adopted Derbyshire Dales Local Plan (2017)
- S1 Sustainable Development Principles
 - S4 Development in the Countryside
 - S9 Rural Parishes Development Strategy
 - PD1 Design and Place Making
 - PD2 Protecting the Historic Environment
 - PD3 Biodiversity and the Natural Environment
 - PD5 Landscape Character
 - PD6 Trees, Hedgerows and Woodlands
 - PD7 Climate Change
 - HC8 Conversion and Re-use of Buildings for Residential Accommodation
 - HC19 Accessibility and Transport
 - HC21 Car Parking Standards
 - EC1 New Employment Development
 - EC8 Promoting Peak District Tourism and Culture
- 3.2 Derbyshire Dales District Council Climate Change Supplementary Planning Document (2021)
- 3.3 Derbyshire Dales District Council Conversion of Farm Buildings Supplementary Planning Document (2019)
- 3.4 Derbyshire Dales District Council Landscape Character and Design Supplementary Planning Document (2018)
- 3.5 National Planning Policy Framework
- 3.6 National Planning Practice Guidance

4. RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

05/00730/LBALT Alterations to listed building - Conversion of mill building and 2 no. barns to form 4 no. dwellings – Granted

05/00729/FUL Change of use and conversion of mill building and 2 no. barns to form 4 no. dwellings, alterations to access, formation of new access, parking area, construction of culvert and associated engineering operations - Granted

05/00726/FUL Erection of stables building - Granted

5. CONSULTATION RESPONSES

Parish Council

5.1 - no comments received.

Environment Agency

- 5.2 - will not be making any formal comment on the submission as the development falls within flood zone 1 and have no fluvial flood risk concerns associated with the site
- there are no other environmental constraints associated with the application site which fall within the remit of the Environment
 - suggest advisory note regarding foul drainage.

Local Highway Authority (Derbyshire County Council)

5.3 - no objection.

Design and Conservation Officer (Derbyshire Dales District Council)

- 5.4 - no objection in principle but suggest amendments to the proposed development and conditions on any grant of planning permission.

Environmental Health (Derbyshire Dales District Council)

- 5.5 - no objection
- to prevent noise nuisance work should be carried out at a reasonable time, not starting before 8am or finishing after 6pm. Work should not be conducted on bank holidays, public holidays or Sundays.

6. REPRESENTATIONS RECEIVED

6.1 None.

7. OFFICER APPRAISAL

Introduction

- 7.1 The matters for consideration are the policy principle, the impact of the proposals on the character and appearance of the stable building, the impact of the proposed agricultural building and the overall impact on the setting of the historic complex of listed buildings to the south. Other matters are highway impacts, ecology and climate change.

Policy principle

- 7.2 Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 requires that applications for planning permission are determined in accordance with the development plan unless material considerations indicate otherwise. The development plan for the purposes of the Act is the Adopted Derbyshire Dales Local Plan (2017). The National Planning Policy Framework (2021) is a material consideration in respect of this application.
- 7.3 The site is located within the countryside in the Adopted Derbyshire Dales Local Plan (2017). Policy S1 (Sustainable Development Principles) advise that all developments should seek to make a positive contribution towards the achievement of sustainable development by improving the economic, environmental and social conditions of the area wherever possible. It also states that development should conserve and, where possible, enhance the distinct Peak District character, the natural and historic environment, including the setting of settlements, both within the Plan area and its surrounding areas including the Peak District National Park in accordance with Policies S4, PD1, PD2, PD5 and EC8 where it relates to development in the countryside.
- 7.4 Policy S4 (Development in the Countryside) advises that outside defined settlement development boundaries, the District Council will seek to ensure that new development protects and, where possible, enhances the landscape's intrinsic character and distinctiveness, including the character, appearance and integrity of the historic and cultural environment and the setting of the Peak District National Park whilst also facilitating sustainable rural community needs, tourism and economic development. The policy supports the sustainable growth of tourism in sustainable locations where needs are not met by existing facilities. Part n) advises in the case of proposals to re-use an existing building or buildings that are capable and worthy of conversion that such development will involve a building that positively contributes to established local character and sense of place.
- 7.5 Policy EC8 (Promoting Peak District Tourism and Culture) also seeks to strengthen the tourism role of the Plan area by supporting and supplementing the tourism offer of the Peak District National Park, with development which is appropriate to the settlements and countryside and consistent with environmental objectives. It is recognised that this can be achieved by enhancing existing serviced accommodation in the countryside through the reuse of existing buildings.
- 7.6 Policy PD1 requires development to be high quality that respects the character, identity and context and contributes positively to an area's character, history and identity in terms of scale, height, density, layout, appearance, materials and the relationship to adjacent buildings and landscape features.
- 7.7 Policy PD2 advises that the District Council will conserve heritage assets in a manner appropriate to their significance. This will take into account the desirability of sustaining and enhancing their significance and will ensure that development proposals contribute positively to the character of the built and historic environment. Particular protection will be given to designated and non-designated heritage assets and their settings; the stable building is within the wider curtilage of the Bradbourne Mill complex of listed buildings.
- 7.8 The District Council's Conversion of Farm Buildings Supplementary Planning Document (2019) seeks to preserve the character and appearance of any farm buildings that are proposed for conversion. It also advises that extensions or additions shall be designed to respect and harmonise with the existing building in terms of the form, shape, character, size, scale and massing. It goes on to state that extensions shall be subservient in their size, scale, form and massing to the original, principal farm building.

- 7.9 Policy PD5 (Landscape Character) advises that the District Council will seek to protect, enhance and restore the landscape character of the Plan area, recognising its intrinsic beauty and its contribution to the economic, environmental and social well-being of the Plan area. The protection of the rural landscape is also reflected upon in the District Council's Landscape Character and Design Supplementary Planning Document (2018).
- 7.10 Policy PD3 (Biodiversity and the Natural Environment) advises that the District Council will seek to protect, manage, and where possible enhance the biodiversity and geological resources of the Plan area, and its surroundings, by ensuring that development proposals will not result in harm to biodiversity or geodiversity interests.
- 7.11 Policy PD7 (Climate Change) seeks to ensure that any development seeks to mitigate against its carbon footprint. This is reflected upon in more detail in the District Council's Climate Change Supplementary Planning Document (2021).
- 7.12 Policy HC8 permits conversions of existing buildings to dwellings provided that the building is of permanent and substantial construction, the form, bulk and general design of the building makes a positive contribution to the character and appearance of its surroundings, it can be converted without extensive alteration, rebuilding or extension and conversion does not have a detrimental impact upon the character and appearance of the building and its surroundings. However, it has been advised by a Planning Inspector in determining recent appeal decisions at Millfield Farm Cottages, Kirk Ireton that this policy cannot be relied upon when considering conversion to holiday let accommodation, despite this being a form of residential development. Similar provisions are, however, included at policy S4 n) in respect of the re-use of buildings in the countryside.
- 7.13 Taking the above into consideration, the above policies allow for the conversion of buildings that positively contribute to established character, to holiday lets within the countryside. In the case of new tourism development plan policy, as confirmed in recent appeal cases requires that proposals are supported where they are appropriate to the countryside and environmental objectives. These provisions align with paragraphs 84 and 85 of the National Planning Policy Framework (2021) supports the sustainable growth of businesses, including rural tourism.
- 7.14 In this particular case the stable building is located within the countryside, outside of any settlement development boundary. In response to the recent decision of the Planning Inspectorate to dismiss an appeal for the conversion of a workshop building within a complex of holiday lets at Millfields Farm Cottages, Kirk Ireton (APP/PI045/W/22/3298112) the applicant advises that the site is a mile from the villages of Tissington and Parwich, and two miles from Brassington.
- 7.15 Addressing officers concerns relating to sustainability of location and access to services and facilities by a variety of different transport methods the applicant advises that site links to Tissington Trail to the west and, via a track, to Carsington in the east. The owners encourage the use of these routes by attaching details of 'car free days out' to their arrival information, including bus links/times to Bradbourne and Tissington should they wish to walk to the bus stop close to Bradbourne Mill. They also provide information on local coach services for trips in and around the Peak District. There are electric vehicle (EV) charging facilities on site which are offered to both guests and staff, as well as opportunities to hire both E-Bikes and normal bicycles, along with information on bus times.
- 7.16 Notwithstanding the above and as recognised in respect of appeal case APP/PI045/W/22/3298112, tourists have different needs to those typically expected for occupiers of a dwelling. The likely needs, or at least wants, of a tourist would be directed towards attractions and hospitality venues. However, they are likely to also need access to

shops, including food shops, in order to purchase gifts, souvenirs, and food to cook when not eating out.

- 7.17 Whilst the building exists, and will extend the tourism offer already provided on site through the conversion of the former mill buildings, the lack of ready access to services and facilities, given the limited bus service that operates in the area and distances involved, is such that the future occupants of the accommodation would be reliant on the private motor vehicle to access the site and attractions and basic services and facilities. The development would therefore be contrary to the locational strategy for tourist facilities and would conflict with Policies S4 and EC8 of the Adopted Derbyshire Dales Local Plan (2017) and the strategy for rural development set out in the National Planning Policy Framework as summarised above.

Whether the building is worthy of conversion and the impact of the proposed conversion on the character and appearance of the building and the setting of the historic complex of Listed buildings

- 7.18 The applicant entered into pre-application discussions with Officers where it was advised that the proposed conversion of the stable building may be acceptable, subject to justification and matters of design detail. The appropriateness of conversion and sustainability of location is a matter of judgement.
- 7.19 The applicant recognises that the stable is relatively modern and sits in an elevated position, close to the Old Mill House. The applicant is of the view that the simple form and timber clad nature of the stable building means that, whilst it does not have historical significance, it appears as an attractive rural building, complementing the existing cluster of historic buildings at Bradbourne Mill.
- 7.20 Part n) of Policy S4 states, in the case of proposals to re-use an existing building or buildings that are capable and worthy of conversion, that such development will involve a building that positively contributes to established local character and sense of place. This recognises that the contribution of a building to its surroundings can override unsustainable development in location terms in the countryside and aligns with the National Planning Policy Framework (2021).
- 7.21 Whilst noting that the building is of permanent and substantial construction, with a tiled roof and timber clad walls, it is a relatively modern building that sits within the Bradbourne Mill complex and is functional in its appearance and relationship with the complex of buildings at Bradbourne Mill. Whilst the stable building is no longer required for the stabling of horses, there is clearly a need for storage and the application seeks permission for a new storage building, a function which this building could continue provide (which is currently its principal use). Considering the development in the round and having regard to the findings of the appointed Inspector in respect of appeal case APP/PI045/W/22/3298112, the building which was erected at a similar time to the conversion of the historic buildings by the site developers and has a simple functional appearance, is not considered to positively contribute to established local character to justify its conversion as an exception to sustainability considerations in location terms.
- 7.22 Notwithstanding the above, if Members considered the development to constitute acceptable re-use of the building in principle, officer's assessment of the conversion and extension proposals and impact on the character and appearance of the building and surroundings as it currently exists is as follows.

Conversion

- 7.23 The alterations proposed to the building, with the amendments that have been made to the extension to replace the current lean-to would preserve its functional appearance. However, this is subject to further details being required and controls, to prevent harm to the setting of the grade II listed buildings. This includes the need for full details of the proposed glazing design, materials, detailing and recess to the large opening on the west elevation.
- 7.24 It is noted that the existing timber doors are to remain in-situ as 'shutters.' It is proposed to replace the stable door (which is to become the entrance door to the holiday let) but the initial design of the replacement door was considered inappropriate and out of character with the building. To this end, this has been replaced with a stable type door which is considered to be a more appropriate response.
- 7.25 It is proposed to block the other stable door opening. However, details of this were unclear. The proposals have been amended in order that the current stable door is retained and only blocked from the inside. The 'utility' room is proposed to be accessed from the interior and it was considered that there was no requirement to form/create an additional external door in the east elevation; this has been removed with the amended proposals.
- 7.26 The proposed inclusion of three rooflights was considered excessive and over-domesticating in character to the building type and design but the proposed rooflight over the living room 'void' has now been omitted. The proposed flue pipe is considered acceptable and the applicant has detailed on the amended drawings that this will be painted black.

Garden Room Extension

- 7.27 Whilst a lean-to exists on the rear of the building, this does not benefit from planning permission. This is essentially proposed to be replaced in the form of a 'garden' room and the extension has been amended to so that it is of a more simple appearance, that does not over domesticate the building and its setting. This is also required as the hedgerow to the rear marks, and is the remains of, an historic field boundary.

Agricultural Storage Building

- 7.28 Setting aside the appropriateness of conversion of the stable building and the storage that this building can continue to provide, it is considered that, in its proposed location, set-back, linearity and matching external materials and details, the proposed storage building is an acceptable addition to the northern end of the stable block in principle, should members be minded to approve this element of the application.

Amenity

- 7.29 There are no dwellinghouses in close proximity to the application site and the Bradbourne Mill complex is now fully in the applicant's ownership as a dwellinghouse and holiday lets. To this end, it is considered that the use of the stable building itself would not have an impact on amenity and nor would the works to undertake the conversion of building and to erect the additional structures.

Highway Matters

- 7.30 The Local Highway Authority has raised no objection to the proposals.

Ecology

- 7.31 Whilst the proposal is to convert the building, it is considered from the pre-application site visit made inside the building by the Case Officer that the building does not house bats or other protected species. In terms of biodiversity, an existing hedge to the rear of the site is now sought to be protected and the overall development will not lead to a loss in biodiversity.

Climate Change

- 7.32 Policy PD7 and guidance contained in the District Council's Climate Change Supplementary Planning Document (2021). To this end, the applicant is proposing a re-use of an existing building and proposes a discreet air source heat pump to assist with heating the building. It is considered that this goes some way to meeting the carbon footprint of the development. The agricultural building and the extension are also proposed to be of timber facing which is a sustainable material. Given the above, it is considered that the proposal has sought to address the aims of Policy PD7 and the District Council's Climate Change Supplementary Planning Document.

Conclusion

- 7.33 It is recognised in this case that whilst the proposal would extend the holiday let accommodation offer at the site, provide some additional employment and have some knock on effects to local businesses and support local tourism generally, the scale of the development is such that these benefits are limited. The unsustainable location of the site and lack of ready access to services and facilities, given the limited bus service that operates in the area, availability of infrastructure and distances involved is such that the future occupants of the accommodation would be reliant on the private motor vehicle to access the site and attractions and basic services and facilities. The development would therefore be contrary to the locational strategy for tourist facilities and would conflict with Policies S4 and EC8 of the Adopted Derbyshire Dales Local Plan (2017) and the strategy for rural development set out in the National Planning Policy Framework.
- 7.34 It is not considered that the stable building, which was erected at a similar time to the conversion of the historic buildings by the site developers makes a positive contribution to established local character to justify its conversion as an exception to sustainability considerations in location terms in this case. It is recommended that the application be refused for these reasons.

8. RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be refused for the following reason:

1. The proposed development involves the conversion of a modern stable building, remote from and with poor access to basic services and facilities for use as a holiday let. The development does not constitute sustainable rural tourism or involve the conversion of a building that makes a positive contribution to its surroundings to warrant conversion to such use in the countryside. The development would therefore be contrary to Policies S4, PD1 and EC8 of the Adopted Derbyshire Dales Local Plan (2017) and the National Planning Policy Framework (2021).

NOTES TO APPLICANT:

1. The Local Planning Authority considered the merits of the submitted application and judged that there was no prospect of resolving the fundamental planning problems with it through negotiation. On this basis the requirement to engage in a positive and proactive manner was considered to be best served by the Local Planning Authority issuing a decision on the application at the earliest opportunity and thereby allowing the applicant to exercise their right to appeal.

2. This decision notice relates to the following documents:

Amended Drawing Nos. 7504-LAT-XX-XX-DP-A-1200-A1-P04, 7504-LAT-XX-XX-DP-A-1400-A1-P05, 7504-LAT-XX-00-DP-A-2200-A1-P04, 7504-LAT-XX-01-DP-A-2201-A1-P04, 7504-LAT-XX-XX-DE-A-3200-A1-P03, 7504-LAT-XX-ZZ-DS-A-4200-A1-P03 received on 2nd December 2022

Design and Access Statement received on 30th September 2022

Additional Information received on 10th January 2023.